

**Minutes of the Board of Commissioners
Multnomah Building, Board Room 100
501 SE Hawthorne Blvd., Portland, Oregon
Thursday, March 3, 2016**

REGULAR MEETING

Chair Deborah Kafoury called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m. with Vice-Chair Loretta Smith and Commissioner Judy Shiprack present. Commissioners Jules Bailey and Diane McKeel were excused.

Also attending were Jenny Madkour, County Attorney, and Marina Baker, Assistant Board Clerk.

Chair Kafoury: ALL RIGHT, GOOD MORNING. WELCOME TO MULTNOMAH COUNTY BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS REGULARLY SCHEDULED BOARD MEETING.

CONSENT AGENDA

- C.1 Budget Modification # DCJ-14-16: Reclasses a Vacant 1.00 FTE Mental Health Consultant to Case Manager 2 in the Juvenile Services Division
- C.2 Resolution Disposing of Abandoned Vessels Left on Multnomah County Waterways
- C.3 Reappointment of Loulie Brown, Roberta Robles, Kimberlee Stafford, and Michael Tynan to the Advisory Committee on Sustainability and Innovation

Chair Kafoury: MAY I HAVE A MOTION ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? COMMISSIONER SMITH MOVES AND COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK SECONDS. ALL IN FAVOR VOTE AYE. [UNANIMOUS AYES] THE CONSENT CALENDAR IS APPROVED.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Opportunity for Public Comment on non-agenda matters. Testimony limited to three minutes per person. This is a time for the Board to hear public testimony, not for Board deliberation.

Board Clerk: PLEASE COME FORWARD WHEN I CALL YOUR NAME. [NAMES READ INTO RECORD]

Chair Kafoury: YOU CAN BEGIN, MR. PHILLIPS.

Mr. Phillips: YES, I'M PAUL PHILLIPS. I SPOKE HERE THE LAST TWO WEEKS ABOUT GETTING ROBBED AT AN ATM. THIS WEEK'S SUBJECT IS NELSON AND

THE UNITED STATES ATTORNEY GENERAL, SHE'S IN TOWN TODAY AND MAYBE SHE'LL BE TALKING TO YOU. AND YESTERDAY BEFORE I START ON THAT, YESTERDAY I WENT DOWN TO PIONEER SQUARE AND I WAS ABLE TO GET THIS MAP, OF THE DISPENSARIES HERE IN DOWNTOWN PORTLAND. IT QUOTED THAT THEY ARE FREE TO ANYBODY THAT'S INTERESTED. AND I WAS WONDERING IF I COULD GET THE BOARD'S AUTOGRAPH ON THIS. I EXPLAINED TO JOE WHEN HE WAS SAYING JUST A FEW MINUTES AGO THAT HE HAD A PROP. I GO MY PROP'S BIGGER THAN YOURS. HE DIDN'T SEEM TO SAY ANYTHING ABOUT THAT. I REALLY AM SERIOUS ABOUT GETTING YOUR AUTOGRAPH AND PERHAPS I COULD EVEN GET LORETTA LYNCH'S AUTOGRAPH ON THIS, AS WELL. MAYBE IT WOULD BE A COLLECTOR'S ITEM SOMEDAY IF I WAS ABLE TO DO THAT. YOU KNOW, IT'S LEGAL IN OREGON. IN FACT, I WAS TEASING PEOPLE, THE IDEA EVEN IF I MET LORETTA LYNCH, SHE'S OVER 21, I'D EVEN GIVE HER A MARIJUANA -- WHAT DO THEY CALL THAT? A MARIJUANA SMOKE.

Mr. Phillips: AND AS FAR AS NELSON, I'M TALKING ABOUT GABBY GIFFORDS' SERVICE ANIMAL. I GUESS YOU MET HER LAST MONTH. DID YOU ASK GABBY GIFFORDS IF HER SERVICE ANIMAL HAD BEEN ATTACKED SEVEN TIMES, LIKE MYSELF? YOU PROBABLY DIDN'T FOR SOME UNKNOWN REASON. MY APARTMENT BUILDING, TOO, IN THE LAST WEEK, IT'S GOT 26 APARTMENTS IN THE BUILDING OF 152 APARTMENTS, THAT'S 17% OF THE BUILDING HAS GOT WATER DAMAGE NOW. I GUESS WHEN IT RAINS IN PORTLAND IT REALLY DOES RAIN. IT WAS CAUSED FROM A SPRINKLER ON THE SIXTH FLOOR THAT WAS BROKEN APPARENTLY. THE CITY AND HOME FORWARD IS GOING TO BE GETTING A BILL FROM THE CONTRACTOR, I'M SURE OF THAT. AND I'M WONDERING HOW MUCH THE TAXPAYER WILL BE STUCK FOR THE BILL ON THAT. IT EVEN ENTERED MY APARTMENT. IT'S DRYING OUT CURRENTLY.

Mr. Lightning: GOOD MORNING, MY NAME IS LIGHTNING, I REPRESENT LIGHTNING WATCHDOG PDX. I GUESS I'M HAVING A LITTLE PROBLEM WITH THIS DECIDE WHO TO CHOOSE TO BE THE NEXT PORTLAND MAYOR. ONE OF THE ISSUES I HAVE ON THIS WHOLE PROCESS IS THAT WHEN WE'RE DENYING CANDIDATES TO ATTEND CERTAIN DEBATES, CANDIDATE FORUMS, I DON'T SEE WHERE THAT'S TO ANYBODY'S ADVANTAGE TO GO IN THAT DIRECTION. AND ONE OF THE ISSUES I HAVE IS THAT TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHO'S REALLY MAKING THAT DETERMINATION. BECAUSE I'M HEARING IT FROM TWO DIFFERENT SIDES. AND A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE KIND OF BACKING UP AND SAYING, I'M NOT MAKING THAT FINAL DECISION. BUT WHAT I HAVE A CONCERN ABOUT IS THAT WHEN WE HAVE CERTAIN LOCATIONS THAT ARE BEING UTILIZED FOR THESE EVENTS, WAS THERE ANY MONEY IN THE PAST, ANY TYPE OF GRANTS OR ANY TYPE OF MONEY COMING FROM CITY OR MULTNOMAH COUNTY TOWARD THESE LOCATIONS? I WANT TO MAKE IT VERY CLEAR TO PEOPLE, THAT WHEN YOU'RE INVITING CANDIDATES THAT HAVE REGISTERED, THAT IF YOU'RE ALSO RECEIVING MONEY IN THE PAST AND ANY TYPE OF GRANT, THESE GRANTS HAVE CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS. HE AND

YOU NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT BEING EQUITABLE AND FAIR, OPEN GOVERNMENT, TRANSPARENCY, OPEN MEETINGS IS VERY IMPORTANT. ESPECIALLY IF YOU'RE RECEIVING ANY TYPE OF FINANCIAL SUPPORT FROM MULTNOMAH COUNTY, CITY OF PORTLAND.

Mr. Lightning: I WANT THIS TO BE LOOKED AT VERY CLOSE TO HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING THAT IF YOU'RE DENYING CERTAIN PEOPLE TO ATTEND THESE EVENTS THAT, IF IT'S MULTNOMAH COUNTY, FUNDED BY MONEY FROM THE CITY OF PORTLAND, YOU NEED TO LOOK AT YOUR GRANTS REAL CLOSE TO UNDERSTAND THAT YOU HAVE CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS TO FOLLOW TO RECEIVE CERTAIN MONEY IN THE FUTURE ON THESE GRANTS. IF YOU'RE RECEIVING FEDERAL MONEY, ALSO, THEY ARE VERY STRICT ON WHAT YOU SHOULD DO, AND CAN'T DO. SO MY POSITION IS, YOU NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU ARE FOLLOWING THE RULES OF YOUR GRANT. YOU ARE FOLLOWING THAT VERY CLOSELY AT THESE CERTAIN LOCATIONS WHEN YOU'RE DENYING CERTAIN CANDIDATES THAT WANT TO SHOW UP, THAT WANT TO BE PART OF THE PROCESS, THAT WANT TO BE INCLUDED, AND TO USE AN EXCUSE THAT YOU DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME DURING THAT A DEBATE TO ALLOW ANOTHER FIVE PEOPLE, THAT'S NOT A VALID EXCUSE. IT'S NOT VALID AT ALL. IT'S JUST GOING ANOTHER HOUR TO ALLOW PEOPLE TO DO THAT. AGAIN, I'M VERY DISAPPOINTED AT THIS TIME AND I HOPE THEY UNDERSTAND, YOU NEED TO INCLUDE ALL PEOPLE IN THIS PROCESS. THANK YOU.

Mr. Walsh: GOOD MORNING, MY NAME IS JOE WALSH, I REPRESENT INDIVIDUALS FOR JUSTICE. AND TODAY'S DAY 21 SINCE WE'VE REQUESTED THAT THE SHERIFF RESIGN. I DON'T HAVE MY POSTAL CERTIFICATES, I HAVE ANOTHER MEETING RIGHT AFTER THIS. WE'LL KEEP COUNT, WE WILL BE HERE EVERY WEEK AS LONG AS OUR HEALTH HOLDS AND WE WILL KEEP THE COUNT. IT IS DAY 21, NEXT WEEK WILL BE DAY 28 AND WE WILL HAVE THE CHART WITH US. NOW TO THE GOOD NEWS. I KNOW YOU'RE VERY FAMILIAR WITH THIS BUT MAYBE SOME OF THE PEOPLE WATCHING THIS OR IN THE AUDIENCE DON'T KNOW ABOUT THIS NEWSPAPER "STREET ROOTS." I PICKED UP ONE YESTERDAY. HE AND THE ARTICLES IN THIS NEWSPAPER ARE VERY GOOD. I MEAN, I'M A WRITER. I DO A LOT OF WRITING. AND I'M ALWAYS IMPRESSED BY THE ARTICLES THAT ARE IN THERE. AND IN THIS ONE THERE'S A FEATURE IN THERE ABOUT THE HOMELESS. THEY JUST INTERVIEW THEM AND JUST ASK THEM QUESTIONS, HOW THEY GOT ON THE STREET, HOW LONG THEY HAVE BEEN ON THE STREET, WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THEM, WHAT DO THEY WISH. I WISH PEOPLE, WHEN THEY SEE THE VENDORS, THE VENDORS BUY THE PAPERS, AND THEN THEY RESELL THEM. THAT'S HOW THEY MAKE THEIR MONEY. AND ANY TIME THAT I BUY A PAPER I GIVE THEM MORE MONEY TO BUY A CUP OF COFFEE OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. AND THE SMILE ON THE VENDOR'S FACE IS WORTH IT.

Mr. Walsh: EVERY WEEK I HAVE A THING THAT I DO AT CITY COUNCIL, I GET A MOCHA. I LOVE MOCHAS. IT IS MY LAST VICE. SO IT COSTS MY \$5 WITH THE TIP. I GIVE THE VENDORS \$5. THAT WE CAN THEY CAN BY A CUP OF COFFEE OR A SANDWICH OR A SNACK OR FEEL LIKE SOMEBODY'S PAYING ATTENTION. IF SOMEBODY ASKS YOU FOR SOMETHING AND YOU GIVE THEM MORE THAN THEY ASK, IT'S REALLY A GOOD FEELING ALL THE WAY AROUND. SO TRY THAT SOMEDAY. A FAMILY MEMBER OR A FRIEND F THEY ASK YOU TO BORROW \$10, GIVE THEM 20 IF YOU HAVE IT. I'M NOT RICH BUT I'VE GOT \$5. I ALWAYS HAVE \$5 FOR A MOCHA. WHY NOT \$5 FOR A VENDOR? I'M ASKING PEOPLE TO PAY ATTENTION. I NOTICING AT CITY HALL LOTS OF PEOPLE WALKING BY. AND YOU KNOW, THEY ARE JUST TOTALLY SHUT OUT. I'M JUST SAYING THESE GUYS WORK HARD. THEY PICK THOSE PAPERS UP IN THE MORNING AND THEY ARE ON THE STREETS ALL DAY. HELP THEM. THAT'S WHAT WE ALWAYS CRY, PULL YOURSELF UP BY THE BOOTSTRAPS, AND THEN WE IGNORE THEM. IT WAS A DELIGHTFUL THINGS. NORMALLY WHEN I COME I'M YELLING AT YOU OR YELLING AT CITY COUNCIL. I THOUGHT I'D SHARE THAT I SMILED AND LAUGHED AND IT WAS REALLY KIND OF COOL. THANK YOU.

REGULAR AGENDA

R.1 Board Briefing on Animal Services Audit. Presenters: Dr. Steve March, County Auditor; Nicole Dewees, Performance Auditor; Jennifer McGuirk, Performance Auditor; and, Jackie Rose, Animal Services Director.

Dr. March: GOOD MORNING. IT'S MY PLEASURE TO BRING TO YOU A BRAND-NEW FORMAT OF AUDIT RECOVER THING. WITH NO FURTHER ADO, FOR THE RECORD, MY NAME IS STEVE MARCH, COUNTY AUDITOR. I'M GOING TURN IT OVER TO MY STAFF TO RUN THROUGH A BRIEF SUMMARY OF IT.

Ms. Dewees: AND I'M NICOLE DEWEES, SENIOR MANAGEMENT AUDITOR.

Ms. McGuirk: GOOD MORNING, I'M JENNIFER MCGUIRK, ALSO AUDITOR AT THE COUNTY AUDITOR'S OFFICE. WE WANTED TO TRY TO CREATE A REPORT THAT WOULD BE REALLY ACCESSIBLE TO THE WIDE CONSTITUENCIES WE THINK HAVE AN INTEREST IN ANIMAL SERVICES. PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITY REALLY CARE ABOUT ANIMALS, CARE ABOUT THEIR PETS. WE WANTED TO DO SOMETHING A LITTLE DIFFERENT. WE'RE GOING SHOW YOU TWO VIDEOS THIS MORNING. THE FIRST PROVIDES BACKGROUND ON ANIMAL SERVICES. THE SECOND IS AN OVERVIEW ON FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. WITHOUT FURTHER ADO.

[VIDEO PLAYS]

Video Narrator: THE MULTNOMAH COUNTY AUDITOR'S OFFICE CONDUCTED A PERFORMANCE AUDIT OF MULTNOMAH COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES. THIS VIDEO IS BACKGROUND INFORMATION ABOUT ANIMAL SERVICES. YOU CAN FIND MORE VIDEOS BY VISITING OUR WEBSITE. THE MISSION OF ANIMAL

SERVICES HE IS TO PROTECT THE HEALTH, SAFETY AND WELFARE OF PEOPLE AND PETS THROUGHOUT MULTNOMAH COUNTY. THEY PROVIDE MANY SERVICES, INCLUDING AN ANIMAL SHELTER, VETERINARY CARE ACCREDITED BY THE AMERICAN ANIMAL HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION, A FOSTER PROGRAM, LOST AND FOUND ANIMAL SERVICES, ANIMAL ADOPTIONS, PET AND FACILITY LICENSING, COMMUNITY-BASED FERAL CAT AND TRAP-NEUTER RELEASE SERVICES, AND ANIMAL CONTROL WITH 24 EMERGENCY RESPONSE, DEAD ANIMAL REMOVAL, NUISANCE COMPLAINTS AND BITE AND CRUELTY INVESTIGATIONS. ANIMAL SERVICES TOOK IN OVER 6700 ANIMALS IN 2014. OVER HALF OF THESE WERE CATS, 41% WERE DOGS. AND THE REST WERE OTHER ANIMALS SUCH AS RABBITS, BIRDS OR REPTILES.

Video Narrator: NEXT WE WILL MOVE ON TO WHAT HAPPENED TO THESE ANIMALS. ABOUT ONE THIRD OF ANIMALS WERE ADOPTED BY NEW OWNERS. ANIMAL SERVICES RETURNED ABOUT A QUARTER OF THE ANIMALS TO THEIR OWNERS. ANIMAL SERVICES TRANSFERRED 24% TO OTHER ORGANIZATIONS. ANIMAL SERVICES EUTHANIZED 11% OF ANIMALS. ACCORDING TO THEIR RECORDS ANIMAL SERVICES HAS MADE HUGE STRIDES AND HAS EUTHANIZED FEWER ANIMALS EVERY YEAR. IN 2010 THEY EUTHANIZED NEARLY 4,000 ANIMALS. IN 2014 THEY EUTHANIZED JUST OVER 700. THE REMAINING ANIMALS IN 2014 HAD OUTCOMES SUCH AS BEING RETURNED TO NATURAL HABITAT OR THEIR OUTCOME WAS UNKNOWN. AS WE'LL MENTION IN ANOTHER VIDEO THEIR CURRENT RECORD-KEEPING SYSTEM IS QUITE OLD AND LACKS MANY CONTROLS TO MAKE SURE ACCURATE AND COMPLETE INFORMATION IS ENTERED. THUS, ANIMAL SERVICE RECORDS ARE NOT ENTIRELY ACCURATE SO THESE NUMBERS MAY BE SUBJECT TO ERROR. ANIMAL SERVICES IS ONE OF THE FOUNDING MEMBERS OF THE ANIMAL SHELTER ALLIANCE OF PORTLAND, WHICH BRINGS TOGETHER VARIOUS ANIMAL WELFARE ORGANIZATIONS IN THE AREA. THE ORGANIZATIONS MEET REGULARLY TO COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS TO SAVE THE LIVES OF ALL SHELTER PETS THAT CAN BE HUGE MAINLY AND RESPONSIBLY REHOMED.

MULTNOMAH COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES HAS MANY SHARED GOALS WITH OTHER ORGANIZATIONS IN THE AREA. BUT THERE'S ONE THING THAT MAKES ANIMAL SERVICES UNIQUE WITHIN MULTNOMAH COUNTY. AND THAT'S BECAUSE ANIMAL SERVICES IS MULTNOMAH COUNTY'S ONLY OPEN DOOR SHELTER. THIS MEANS ANIMAL SERVICES IS MANDATED BY COUNTY CODE TO ACCEPT ALL ANIMALS BROUGHT TO THEIR FACILITY. WHILE OTHER ORGANIZATIONS WORK HARD TO HELP AS MANY ANIMALS AS THEY CAN, THEY SOMETIMES TURN ANIMALS AWAY OR REFUSE TO ACCEPT ADOPTION RETURNS. IN CONTRAST, ANIMAL SERVICES MUST TAKE ALL ANIMALS, INCLUDING THOSE WITH SIGNIFICANT MEDICAL OR BEHAVIORAL ISSUES. LIKE OTHER OPEN DOOR SHELTERS ANIMAL SERVICES CARES FOR THESE ANIMALS WITHIN BUDGETARY CONSTRAINTS THAT CAN AFFECT THE QUALITY OF CARE. THE ANIMAL SHELTER IS LOCATED IN TROUTDALE AND SERVES ALL

OF MULTNOMAH COUNTY. THANK YOU FOR VIEWING THIS SEGMENT. YOU CAN FIND MORE VIDEOS BY VISITING OUR WEBSITE.

Video Narrator: THE MULTNOMAH COUNTY AUDITOR'S OFFICE CONDUCTED A PERFORMANCE AUDIT OF MULTNOMAH COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES. THIS IS AN OVERVIEW OF OUR AUDIT. YOU CAN FIND VIDEOS WITH MORE DETAILED INFORMATION BY VISITING OUR WEBSITE. WE WANT TO THANK THE EMPLOYEES AND VOLUNTEERS AT ANIMAL SERVICES FOR THEIR ASSISTANCE DURING THIS AUDIT. WE FOUND THE EMPLOYEES AND VOLUNTEERS TO BE INCREDIBLY HARDWORKING AND DEDICATED. BASED ON MONTHS OF OBSERVATION ANALYSIS, WE RECOMMEND THAT ANIMAL SERVICES IMPROVE RECORD KEEPING AND DATA QUALITY, IMPROVE SHELTER OPERATIONS TO PROTECT ANIMAL HEALTH AND SAFETY, IMPROVE PLANNING AND PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT, AND IMPROVE OPERATIONS TO PROTECT HUMAN HEALTH AND SAFETY. FIRST WE WILL DISCUSS RECORD KEEPING AND DATA QUALITY. WE LOOKED AT A FIVE-YEAR TIME PERIOD AND FOUND A FEW THOUSAND ANIMALS WITH INCORRECT OR MISSING INFORMATION. FOR EXAMPLE, SOME ANIMALS HAVE NO RECORD OF WHAT HAPPENED TO THEM AFTER THEY LEFT THE SHELTER OR HOW THEY ENDED UP AT THE SHELTER IN THE FIRST PLACE.

WE ALSO FOUND THAT STAFF DIDN'T RECORD ALL INSTANCES WHEN THEY USED EUTHANASIA DRUGS. BECAUSE THESE ARE CONTROLLED SUBSTANCES IT IS NECESSARY THAT ANIMAL SERVICES KEEP GOOD RECORDS. NEXT, WE WILL DISCUSS IMPROVING SHELTER OPERATIONS TO CONDUCT ANIMAL HEALTH AND SAFETY. WE FOUND THERE WERE NOT ENOUGH EMPLOYEES TO PROPERLY FEED ANIMALS AND CLEAN THEIR HOUSING. WE FOUND THEY NEEDED 18 ADDITIONAL HOURS PER DAY TO MEET THE STAFFING GUIDELINE. STAFF WORK VERY HARD TO FEED AND CLEAN BUT THERE ARE SIMPLY NOT ENOUGH EMPLOYEES. THE ANIMAL HOUSING AREAS APPEARED CLEAN DESPITE STAFFING CHALLENGES THEY FACED. WE WERE ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT A LACK OF CONSISTENT ANIMAL ENRICHMENT. FOR EXAMPLE, THIS IS GOTHAM. DURING THE TIME WE OBSERVED HIM HE ONLY RECEIVED ONE WALK IN NINE DAYS.

IN ADDITION TO GOTHAM, WE'VE FOUND THAT MOST ANIMALS DID NOT RECEIVE THE RECOMMENDED AMOUNT OF ENRICHMENT. THIS LACK OF ENRICHMENT CAN BE MENTALLY AND PHYSICALLY TAXING ON DOGS AND CATS. IT ALSO MAKES THEM LESS LIKELY TO BE ADOPTED BECAUSE THEY MAY BE LESS SOCIAL THAN NORMAL. MANY WORK HARD TO PROVIDE SOCIAL CONTACT AND PHYSICAL ACTIVITY BUT THERE ARE SIMPLY NOT ENOUGH VOLUNTEERS AND EMPLOYEES. WE WERE ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT INCONSISTENT TRAINING. IN A SURVEY OF EMPLOYEES WHO HAVE DIRECT CONTACT WITH ANIMALS, MANY OF THEM SAID THEY HAD NEVER RECEIVED FORMAL TRAINING IN IMPORTANT AREAS. FOR EXAMPLE, 34% HAD NEVER BEEN TRAINED HOW TO HANDLE ANIMALS HUMANELY WITH THE LEAST

AMOUNT OF FORCE. 41% HAD NOT BEEN TRAINED IN HOW TO RECOGNIZE ANIMAL BODY LANGUAGE. AND 45% HAD NOT BEEN TRAINED IN HOW TO RECOGNIZE COMMON ANIMAL MEDICAL PROBLEMS. NEXT, WE'LL DISCUSS IMPROVING PLANNING AND PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT. ONE OF ANIMAL SERVICES' STRENGTHS IS THEIR ABILITY TO GENERATE INNOVATIVE IDEAS TO HELP ANIMALS IN OUR COMMUNITY. MANY PROGRAMS DID NOT HAVE PLANS TO EMPLOYEE TRAINING, BUDGETING OR DEVELOPMENT OF LONG TERM GOALS. WE IDENTIFIED SEVERAL PROGRAMS THAT WERE WELL-INTENDED. BECAUSE THEY LACKED PLANNING AND GOALS WE COULD NOT MEASURE IF THEY WERE SUCCESSFUL.

Video Narrator: NEXT WE WILL MOVE ON TO OPERATIONS TO PRESS CONFERENCE HUMAN HEALTH AND SAFETY. ONE OF OUR CONCERNS IS THAT THE SHELTER HAS ADOPTED AN ANIMAL WHO HAS INJURED PEOPLE AND OTHER ANIMALS. NOT ALL ADAPTERS HAVE BEEN INFORMED OF AN ANIMAL'S BITE HISTORY. THIS PRACTICE PRESENTS A RISK TO THEIR PUBLIC SAFETY. THE SHELTER WORK ENVIRONMENT HAS NEGATIVELY AFFECTED THE WELL-BEING OF SOME EMPLOYEES. ANOTHER AREA OF CONCERN IS THE SAFETY OF ANIMAL CONTROL OFFICERS. WHEN AN ANIMAL CONTROL OFFICER RESPONDS TO A CALL THEY DO NOT HAVE CEOS TO CRIMINAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION SO THEY HAVE NO IDEA ABOUT THE POTENTIAL RISKS BEHIND THE DOOR. ANIMAL CONTROL OFFICERS DO NOT CARRY FIREARMS AND HAVE LIMITED WAYS TO PROTECT THEMSELVES.

THE OREGON HUMANE SOCIETY ALSO HAS OFFICERS THAT RESPOND TO ANIMAL CRUELTY COMPLAINTS AND THEY HAVE ACCESS TO CRIMINAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION. IT SEEMS SINCE ANIMAL SERVICES OFFERS THE SAME SERVICES, PLUS HAS MORE OF AN ENFORCEMENT ROLE, THAT THE SAME CRIMINAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION PRIVILEGES SHOULD ALSO BE GRANTED TO ANIMAL SERVICES. BECAUSE OF THE KINDS OF HEALTH AND SALE OF THE ISSUES WE OBSERVED, WE RECOMMEND THAT THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS ESTABLISH A POLICY THAT PROVIDES PROGRAMS FOR WHEN IT IS SAFE TO REHOME ANIMALS, SUPPORT ANIMAL SERVICES IN GETTING CEOS TO CRIMINAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION, AND PROVIDE ANIMAL SERVICES WITH THE FUNDING TO INCREASE STAFFING TO MEET NATIONAL STANDARDS. THANK YOU FOR VIEWING THIS SEGMENT. YOU CAN FIND MORE VIDEOS THAT GO INTO GREATER DETAIL BY VISITING OUR WEBSITE.

Dr. March: I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT THAT THE FIELD WORK DONE HERE WAS DONE BEFORE THE NEW DIRECTOR CAME IN. SO THESE WERE CONDITIONS THAT SHE'S WALKED INTO AND WE'VE NOTED AND THEY NOTE IN THE DEPARTMENT'S RESPONSE THAT SOME OF THESE HAVE ALREADY BEEN ADDRESSED. HOWEVER, IT'S RARE WHEN WE COME TO YOU AND SUGGEST THAT YOU PROVIDE ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR STAFFING AND WE DO THAT WHOLEHEARTEDLY IN THIS CASE.

Chair Kafoury: YOU KNOW WE'RE RIGHT IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BUDGET SO YOU THOUGHT IT WAS A REALLY OPPORTUNE TIME – [LAUGHTER]

Dr. March: IS IT BUDGET TIME? OH, MY GOODNESS! THANK YOU. AND WE'D LIKE TO INVITE THE ANIMAL SERVICES AND DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY SERVICES TO COME UP.

Chair Kafoury: GREAT, THANK YOU. ACTUALLY, DO WE WANT TO DO THAT FIRST OR ASK QUESTIONS?

Dr. March: IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS AT THIS POINT, YES QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD?

Vice-Chair Smith: YES, I DO. IN 2010, THERE WERE LIKE 4,000 FERAL CATS AND IT WENT DOWN TO 700? WHAT DID THEY DO TO DECREASE THAT?

Ms. McGuirk: IT WAS EUTHANASIA, NOT INSTANCES OF FERAL CATS.

Vice-Chair Smith: OKAY. THE OTHER PIECE IN TERMS OF TRAINING AND EDUCATION, ARE YOU SAYING THEY NEED THIS IMMEDIATELY IN THE ANIMAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT?

Dr. March: I WOULD SAY YES.

Ms. McGuirk: YEAH. WE RECOMMEND IN THE SECTION WE HAVE ON TRAINING THAT THEY DEVELOP AN ON-BOARDING PROGRAM FOR NEW STAFF AND CREATE ONGOING TRAINING. IT'S BEEN VERY DIFFICULT FOR STAFF AND VOLUNTEERS TO GET THE TRAINING THEY NEED.

Vice-Chair Smith: HOW MANY STAFF ARE YOU RECOMMENDING?

Ms. McGuirk: ALL OF THE STAFF THERE NEEDS TO BE TRAINED.

Dr. March: NUMBER OF STAFF, THREE TO FOUR, JUST BASED ON THE ANIMAL CARE SIDE.

Ms. McGuirk: THAT'S FOR ADDING STAFF.

Vice-Chair Smith: SO THE LAST QUESTION, WHY IS MORALE SO BAD AT ANIMAL SERVICES?

Ms. McGuirk: WE LOOKED INTO THIS VERY CLOSELY BECAUSE OF SOME OF THE INTERVIEWS WE WERE HAVING WITH PEOPLE. IT SEEMED LIKE THE SHELTER MANAGEMENT WAS QUITE POOR. AND LINE STAFF IN PARTICULAR, AS WELL AS LEADS, WERE HAVING DIFFICULTY IN THAT ENVIRONMENT.

Chair Kafoury: OUR NEW ANIMAL SERVICES DIRECTOR CAN PROBABLY ANSWER THAT QUESTION.

Vice-Chair Smith: BUT THEY BROUGHT IT UP IN THEIR REPORT. WHEN YOU SAY POOR, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN? I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT MEANS.

Dr. March: THERE WERE SOME INCONSISTENCIES IN MANAGEMENT, AND YOU MAY RECALL WE HAD APPEAR INTERIM DIRECTOR.

Vice-Chair Smith: YES.

Dr. March: SO I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S COUNTYWIDE IS WE HAVE A TENDENCY NOT TO PROVIDE ENOUGH TRAINING FOR MANAGER WHOSE COME IN, EITHER FROM THE OUTSIDE OR WHO COME UP THROUGH THE RANKS. THEY DON'T ALWAYS GET TRAINING IN MANAGEMENT. THEY GET TRAINING IN THEIR FIELD BUT NOT IN MANAGEMENT. AND IT'S A DIFFERENT ROLE TO STEP INTO A MANAGEMENT ROLE.

Vice-Chair Smith: AND TO BE ABLE TO COMMUNICATE AND DELEGATE. OKAY. THANK YOU.

Mr. Peoples: GOOD MORNING, MADAM CHAIR, COMMISSIONERS. KIM PEOPLES, DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY SERVICES. JOINING ME IS THE ILLUSTRIOUS JACKIE ROSE, NEW TO THE COUNTY AND STEPPING INTO A WONDERFUL ORGANIZATION THAT'S MADE A TREMENDOUS IMPACT TO THE ANIMALS WE SERVE AS WELL AS THE COMMUNITY. I'D LIKE TO START BY THANKING AUDITOR MARCH AND THE AUDIT TEAM FOR THEIR THOROUGH AND OBJECTIVE REVIEW AND ANALYSIS, AND THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SYSTEMS AND PROGRAMS IN THE ANIMAL SERVICES DIVISION. THAT BEING SAID WE HAVE SEEN MANY OF THE DEFICIENCIES OURSELVES THAT HAVE BEEN NOTED AND HAVE TAKEN STEPS TO BEGIN TO CORRECT AND ENHANCE SEVERAL OF THE SERVICES WE PROVIDE TO THE ANIMALS WE CARE FOR.

THE TIMING OF THE AUDIT IS FORTUITOUS, AS JACKIE HERSELF IN HER SHORT TENURE AS DIRECTOR HAS ALSO CONDUCTED AN ASSESSMENT OF OPERATIONS AND POLICIES. IN TANDEM, THE DEPARTMENT HAS EXPLICIT GUIDANCE IN AREAS WE'LL BE FOCUSING ON GOING FORWARD TO IMPROVE OUR SERVICES. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE AUDIT TEAM FOR THE RECOGNITION IN THE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS ANIMAL SERVICES HAS MADE IN REDUCING THE EUTHANASIA RATE AND SAVING MORE ANIMAL LIVES. TO PUT THIS INTO CONTEXT, THE LIVE RELEASE RATE FOR THE ANIMALS SERVED BETWEEN 2007 AND 2014 HAS DRAMATICALLY IMPROVED.

Mr. Peoples: FOR AN EXAMPLE, IN FISCAL YEAR 2007, 36% WAS THE LIVE RELEASE RATE FOR CATS. IN 2014, IT WAS 87%. FOR DOGS, IN 2007, IT WAS 70% LIVE RELEASE. IN 2014, 94%. THIS LEVEL OF IMPROVEMENT COULD NOT HAVE BEEN ACCOMPLISHED WITHOUT A STRONG DEDICATION TO EXPLORING PROGRAM OPTIONS AND A WILLINGNESS TO TAKE RISKS TO TRY SOMETHING NEW. I DEEPLY APPRECIATE THE AUDIT TEAM'S ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF THE COMMITMENT, COMPASSION AND DEDICATION OF STAFF. AND VOLUNTEERS TO SERVE THE ANIMALS AS WELL AS THE COMMUNITY WE SERVE. I'D LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO JACKIE TO SHARE HER IMPRESSIONS AND INITIAL STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE RECOMMENDATIONS.

Chair Kafoury: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING.

Ms. Rose: IT'S MY HONOR TO BE HERE AND I, TOO, WOULD LIKE TO ECHO THE SENTIMENT THAT I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE TIME AND THOROUGHNESS GIVEN TO THIS AUDIT BY AUDITOR MARCH AND HIS TEAM. I THINK THAT THEY WERE VERY COMPREHENSIVE IN THEIR REVIEW AND WE GREATLY APPRECIATE THE INFORMATION THAT'S BEEN PROVIDED. AS DIRECTOR PEOPLES' MENTIONED, I TOO HAVE BEEN DOING MY OWN EVALUATION AND ASSESSMENT HAVING JOINED THIS TEAM IN THE MIDDLE OF THE OCTOBER. MOST, IF NOT ALL, OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS MADE BY THE AUDITING, I'M IN AGREEMENT WITH. THERE IS ABSOLUTELY ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT. HOWEVER, I DO WANT TO JUST MENTION ONE OF THE REASONS I CAME, PROBABLY THE PRIMARY REASON I CAME TO MULTNOMAH COUNTY AND ACCEPTED THIS POSITION IS THAT I WAS SO IMPRESSED AS AN OUTSIDER LOOKING IN AT THE KINDS OF PROGRESS AND IMPROVEMENTS THAT HAD BEEN MADE HERE OVER THE PAST MANY YEARS.

THE KINDS OF ACTIVITIES THAT HAVE GONE ON, COMMISSIONER CHAIR HAD ASKED HOW THE EUTHANASIA RATES HAD DRASTICALLY CHANGED OVER THE YEARS. THAT'S A GROUP OF PEOPLE WANTING TO BE INNOVATIVE IN THE WAY THEY PROVIDE SERVICES HERE IN MULTNOMAH COUNTY. TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE LIVE RELEASES NUMBERS AT THIS RATE THIS ORGANIZATION IS ABLE TO DO IS REALLY OUTSTANDING. THAT SPEAKS TO THE LEVEL OF COMMITMENT AND DEDICATION, NOT ONLY BY THE STAFF BUT THE MANAGEMENT TEAM AND THE VOLUNTEERS. MY OVERALL IMPRESSIONS ARE I ABSOLUTELY AGREE THERE IS WITHOUT A DOUBT ROOM FOR IMPROVEMENT. WE WILL LOOK AT ALL OF THESE POINTS. WE'VE ALREADY BEGUN TO MAKE MULTIPLE CHANGES, AS AUDITOR MARCH HAD INDICATED. I'M JUST ACTUALLY VERY PLEASED AND HONORED TO BE PART OF THIS PROCESS AND BEING ABLE TO HELP THIS TEAM MOVE THIS FORWARD AT THIS TIME.

Chair Kafoury: QUESTIONS, COMMENTS?

Vice-Chair Smith: WHAT HAVE YOU DONE TO IMPROVE THE WALKING, THE NINE DAYS THEY TALKED ABOUT IN THE REPORT, SOME ANIMALS WERE NOT WALKED WITHIN NINE DAYS. WHAT HAVE YOU DONE TO IMPROVE THAT NUMBER?

Ms. Rose: I WILL BE VERY HONEST WITH YOU, THAT NUMBER IS CONCERNING TO ME. HOWEVER, MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE SINCE I'VE BEEN HERE HAS NOT BEEN THE SAME. I THINK THERE ARE SITUATIONS THAT HAVE OCCURRED. I CAN'T SPEAK TO THAT SPECIFIC SITUATION, I WASN'T HERE. THAT DOES NOT SEEM TO BE THE NORM FOR THE WAY ANIMALS ARE WALKED OR HANDLED. THE OTHER PIECE THAT I CAN'T SPEAK TO, TO BE VERY HONEST FOR THAT ONE CASE, IS SPECIFICALLY WHY. IT MAY SIMPLY HAVE BEEN AN OVERSIGHT. BUT THERE MAY HAVE BEEN OTHER CONTRIBUTING FACTORS. WHAT I CAN TELL YOU IS THAT MOVING FORWARD OUR GOAL IS TO PROVIDE THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF ENRICHMENT WE ABSOLUTELY CAN FOR ALL ANIMALS.

WE UTILIZE VOLUNTEERS ON AN EXTENSIVE BASIS. WE HAVE AN AMAZING GROUP OF VOLUNTEERS. APPROXIMATELY 150 VOLUNTEERS COMING TO HANDLE ANIMALS WITH US. WE USE THEM AND RELY UPON THEM VERY OFTEN AND VERY MUCH TO HELP WITH THIS COMPONENT. IN ADDITION, THE STAFF ARE DEDICATED TO MAKING SURE THE ANIMALS ARE GETTING AS MUCH ATTENTION AS THEY POSSIBLY CAN. I HAVE TO PUT THE CAVEAT IN THAT THAT'S DIFFICULT WHEN WE ARE AS LIMITED AS WE ARE WITH THE STAFFING PATTERNS.

Vice-Chair Smith: I JUST WANT TO GO BACK TO JUST ONE SECOND. I'M NOT SURE I GOT MY QUESTION ANSWERED, SO I'LL ASK IT THE OTHER WAY. HOW OFTEN ARE THE PETS BEING WALKED?

Ms. Rose: THE DOGS, IT ACTUALLY DEPENDS WHICH SIDE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. WE HAVE THREE KENNELS. THE SECURITY KENNELS GET LIMITED ATTENTION BECAUSE THEY ARE CONSIDERED DANGEROUS AT THAT POINT. FOR THE DOGS IN THE ADOPTION CENTER ON THE ADOPTION SIDE, THOSE DOGS ARE GETTING MULTIPLE WALKS EACH DAY BY STAFF AS WELL AS BY VOLUNTEERS. ON THE INTAKE SIDE THAT AREA IS MORE LIMITED BECAUSE WE LIMIT VOLUNTEER ACTIVITY. THE GOAL IS THAT EACH DOG SHOULD GET AT LEAST TWO WALKS PER DAY. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON. AND AGAIN, THAT'S ABOVE AND BEYOND THE TIME THEY ARE INTERACTING FOR CARE AND FEEDING AND MEDICAL CARE AND OTHER SOCIALIZATION TO THE BEST OF OUR ABILITY WITH A LIMITED STAFF. BUT THAT IS THE GOAL. WE DO ALSO HAVE THE KENNELS THAT ARE DOUBLE-SIDED WHICH ALLOWS THEM IN AND OUT. THEY ARE NOT CONFINED TO A SINGLE SPACE 24 HOURS. THEY HAVE IN AND OUT AND THAT'S UTILIZED OFTEN WITH DOGS WE'RE NOT SURE ABOUT AND NOT COMFORTABLE WITH THEIR HANDLING.

Vice-Chair Smith: I'LL FOLLOW BACK UP WITH YOU WITH MY STAFF. THERE ARE MORE QUESTIONS I HAVE FOR YOU.

Commissioner Shiprack: MADAM CHAIR, IF I COULD JUST COMMENT AND TRY AND FORM A CONTEXT AROUND WHAT I'VE HEARD THIS MORNING. I THINK IT'S PRETTY REMARKABLE. MY LIMITED MATH SKILLS TOOK YOUR INTAKE NUMBERS AND DIVIDED BY DAYS IN THE AREA AND IT COMES UP TO BE SOMEWHAT IN THE VICINITY OF 20 ANIMALS PER DAY, UP AGAINST THE SORT OF LIMITING FACTORS OF A REALLY POOR FACILITY, THE LIMITED STAFFING LEVELS, AND THEN WHAT'S REPORTED THAT I HADN'T HEARD BEFORE OF STAFF MORALE ISSUES, THIS EXTRAORDINARY OUTCOME MEASUREMENT OF IMPROVEMENT. SO JUST IMAGINE WHERE WE COULD BE WHEN WE ADDRESS THE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN BROUGHT FORWARD IN THE AUDIT. SO THIS IS REALLY A TREMENDOUS MOMENT OF OPPORTUNITY I THINK FOR ANIMAL SERVICES. AND WELCOME, JACKIE, NICE TO HAVE YOU WITH US.

Chair Kafoury: I WANT TO THANK ALL OF YOU, AS WELL. I KNOW WE HAVE SOME PUBLIC TESTIMONY. I THINK COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK REALLY NAILED IT ON THE HEAD. THIS IS A GREAT MOMENT OF OPPORTUNITY. IT'S WONDERFUL THIS AUDIT HAS COME OUT RIGHT AS WE HAVE A NEW DIRECTOR IN CHARGE. YOU HAVE THE ABILITY TO SEE WITH YOUR OWN EYES WHAT THEY FOUND IN THE YOU HAD A DEBT. I'M SURE MANY OF THESE THINGS ARE SOMETHING THAT YOU'VE NOTICED PROBABLY ON DAY ONE. SO I THINK THIS IS GREAT. I HAVE THE UTMOST CONFIDENCE THAT YOU WILL BE ABLE TO ADDRESS AS MANY OF THESE AS YOU CAN AS WE MOVE FORWARD, KNOWING THAT, AGAIN, THE CONFINES OF THIS REALLY OUTDATED BUILDING DO ADD TO IT.

KNOWING THAT'S ON OUR LIST OF THE OTHER MANY FACILITY IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE NEED TO MAKE AROUND THE COUNTY BUT THIS IS SOMETHING ON THAT LIST, AS WELL. SO I JUST HARKEN BACK TO THE YEARS WE'VE BEEN HERE. EVERY SO OFTEN WHEN WE HAVE A REPORT FROM ANIMAL SERVICES AND WE LEARN ABOUT REALLY HOT SPOTS, A FEW YEARS AGO IT WAS THE EUTHANASIA RATE WHICH WAS EXTREMELY HIGH. I JUST WANT TO COMMEND YOU. I HONESTLY WILL SAY I DIDN'T REALLY THINK WE WOULD BE WHERE WE ARE TODAY WITH THAT. SO I WANT TO COMMEND YOU. IT SHOWS ME WHEN WE PUT OUR MINDS TO FIXING A PROBLEM WE CAN DO IT. THAT'S YOUR CHALLENGE. AND KNOW THAT WE'RE BEHIND YOU TO HELP AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING BACK FROM YOU. TO SEE HOW THESE ITEMS HAVE BEEN ADDRESSED.

Board Clerk: FOR PUBLIC COMMENT, SARAH RIDDLE, PLEASE COME FORWARD.

Ms. Riddle: GOOD MORNING, I'M NOT A PUBLIC SPEAKER, SO FORGIVE ME. MY NAME IS SARAH RIDDLE. I HAVE BEEN A VOLUNTEER IN THE DOG KENNELS AT MULTNOMAH COUNTY ANIMAL SERVICES SINCE SEPTEMBER OF 2013. I WAS A VOLUNTEER WHO WALKED GOTHAM ONE TIME IN NINE DAYS. I HAVE SPENT

THE LAST COUPLE DAYS REVIEWING THE AUDITING MATERIALS POSTED TO THE MULTNOMAH COUNTY WEBSITE. I WANT TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT OF THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. THE REPORT IDENTIFIED MANY OF THE SAME CONCERNS I AND OTHERS HAVE HAD. I ADMIRE MCAS STAFFS TREMENDOUSLY FOR OPERATING UNDER THE CONDITIONS FOR SO LONG WITH AN ENDURANCE OF COMPASSION THAT I CAN'T IMAGINE HAVING AND MOST PEOPLE ARE NOT EVEN CAPABLE OF.

Ms. Riddle: I HAVE WATCHED WITH GREAT AND GROWING CONCERN AS STAFF MEMBERS HAVE ENDURED HIGH PRESSURE FROM MANAGEMENT, LACK OF RESOURCES, CHRONIC UNDERSTAFFING, THE LEGAL REQUIREMENT TO INTAKE EVERY ANIMAL REGARDLESS OF MEDICAL OR BEHAVIORAL ISSUES ALL IN AN INADEQUATE FACILITY OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. I'M PLEASED THAT THE AUDIT HAS TOUCHED ON ALL OF THESE ISSUES. MCAS' EVER INCREASING LIVE RELEASE RATE IS FREQUENTLY SITED AS PROGRESS TO MASK THE CHRONIC PROBLEMS. IT MIGHT BE CONTROVERSIAL TO SAY THIS, BUT IT IS NOT MY OPINION THAT A HIGH LIVE RELEASE RATE IS OR SHOULD BE THE MEASURE OF SUCCESS FOR AN ANIMAL SHELTER.

I ACTUALLY THINK THAT IT IS THE PRESSURE FOR THIS RATE THAT HAS BEEN THE DRIVER OF MANY PROBLEMS MCAS IS FACING AND THE AUDITORS HAVE IDENTIFIED. MY LAST TWO YEARS AS A VOLUNTEER AT MCAS HAVE BEEN VERY EMOTIONAL. I ENJOY THE WORK IMMENSELY AND FIND IT VERY REWARDING. THIS EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN PUNCTUATED BY MANY MOMENTS OF TOTAL DESPAIR AT THE CONDITIONS AND THE VERY SAD CONDITIONS WE OFTEN FACE AS SHELTER VOLUNTEERS AND STAFF. READING THE AUDIT DOCUMENTS AND WATCHING THE VIDEO HAS CAUSED ME TO BECOME EMOTIONAL AND EVEN CRY AT SEVERAL POINTS, WITH THE REALIZATION THAT CONCERNS MANY OF US HAD, HAVE BEEN HEARD, INVESTIGATED, VALIDATED, REPORTED, AND MADE INTO COUNTY RECORD.

TO THE COUNTY AUDITING TEAM, MY DEEPEST GRATITUDE FOR YOUR THOROUGH WORK, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS. I KNOW IT COULD NOT HAVE BEEN AN EASY PROCESS. I'M LOOKING FORWARD ATTENTION, RESOURCES, IMPROVEMENTS AND GUIDANCE FROM YOU, THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS, ON THE DIRECTION AND OVERSIGHT MCAS OPERATIONS NOW AND IN THE FUTURE. I LEAVE YOU TODAY VERY HOPEFUL THAT WITH THIS AUDIT AND NEW DIRECTOR OF MCAS, JACKIE ROSE, THAT MCAS WILL SEE CONSISTENT AND MEASURED IMPROVEMENT IN THE NEAR FUTURE AND SUSTAINED FOR THE LONG TERM. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

Board Clerk: WE HAVE ONE MORE TESTIMONY, JANE MCFARLAND.

Ms. McFarland: GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS JANE MCFARLAND. I'D LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT I AM EMPLOYED BY MULTNOMAH COUNTY BUT AM ON LEAVE AT THIS MOMENT AND AM HERE AS A PRIVATE

CITIZEN. FOR ABOUT SIX YEARS I'VE HAD SOME INVOLVEMENT AS A VOLUNTEER WITH THE SHELTER. THE FIRST FOUR YEARS WITH A LOT OF PASSION, THE LAST TWO YEARS WITH MORE DESPAIR. I'VE HAD TO STEP BACK MY INVOLVEMENT BECAUSE OF CONCERNS THAT I'VE HAD WITH THE OPERATIONS AT THE SHELTER. I ACTUALLY AM ONE OF THE PEOPLE WHO EXPERIENCED A BITE SITUATION WITH AN ANIMAL THAT WAS RELEASED, AND I HAD NOT BEEN SHARED INFORMATION ABOUT THE DOG'S HISTORY AND ACTUALLY STAFF'S CONCERNS ABOUT THEIR BEHAVIOR. SO BASED ON THAT, I WANT TO BRING SOME OBJECTIVITY BUT I ALSO HAVE A LOT OF PASSION AROUND THE PROGRAMS AT THE SHELTER.

Ms. McFarland: I'M VERY EXCITED THAT THERE IS A NEW DIRECTOR AND THAT SHE'S GOING BENEFIT FROM THE AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS. I WOULD ASK THAT THERE IS SOME GOAL-SETTING AROUND THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE AUDIT. AND THAT THERE IS SOME REQUIRED REPORTING MECHANISM TO UPPER MANAGEMENT OF DCS AND POSSIBLY EACH TO THE BOARD. I'M GLAD THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE BEING EMBRACED AS THEY ARE BUT I DO THINK THAT IT'S ALWAYS GOOD TO HAVE A BASELINE ESTABLISHED AND THEN SET SOME SMART GOALS AROUND THOSE OBJECTIVES. SO AS PART OF THE AUDIT RECOMMENDATION I WOULD HOPE IT WOULD INCLUDE SOME MEASURABLE GOALS AND ACCOUNTABILITY.

I ALSO WANT TO SUPPORT THE AUDIT'S RECOMMENDATION OF LOOKING AT STAFFING LEVELS. MIKE OSWALD ONCE TOLD ME THAT THE ANIMAL SERVICES GETS THE EQUIVALENT OF FOUR FTE OUT OF VOLUNTEERS. I DON'T THINK YOU'LL FIND ANY OTHER PROGRAM IN THE COUNTY THAT RELIES TO THAT EXTENT ON VOLUNTEERISM FOR THEIR OPERATIONS. I WOULD ALSO HOPE THAT IF THERE'S INCREASE IN STAFFING THAT IT IS IN DIRECT SERVICES TO THE ANIMALS AS OPPOSED TO INVESTMENT IN ADDITIONAL MANAGEMENT. AND I KNOW VOLUNTEERS AND STAFF WILL REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO ADDITIONAL TRAINING FOR THE WIDE VARIETY OF SITUATIONS THAT WE FIND OURSELVES IN AT THE SHELTER. THANK YOU.

Chair Kafoury: THANK YOU. WE ARE GOING MOVE THE SCHEDULE AROUND A LITTLE BIT. WE WILL SKIP OVER R.2 TO R.3.

(Recess as the Multnomah County Board of Commissioners and convene as the Public Contract Review Board)

R.3 Approval for Use of a Job Order Contracting Solicitation Process as an Alternative Contracting Method. Presenters: Brian R. Smith, Purchasing Manager & Henry Alaman, Facilities Manager.

Chair Kafoury: COMMISSIONER SMITH MOVES AND COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK SECONDS APPROVAL OF R.3. GOOD MORNING.

Mr. Smith: MY NAME IS BRIAN SMITH, I'M THE PURCHASING MANAGER FOR MULTNOMAH COUNTY. TODAY WE'RE HERE BEFORE YOU, I'M HERE WITH HENRY ALAMAN, OUR FACILITIES DIRECTOR, TO TALK ABOUT JOB ORDER CONTRACTOR. THERE ARE TWO ITEMS BEFORE YOU TODAY. THE FIRST ITEM IS TO APPROVE AN ALTERNATIVE CONTRACTING PROCESS, TO SPECIFICALLY ALLOW US TO CONDUCT A JOB ORDER CONTRACTING PROCUREMENT FOR CERTAIN SERVICES. JOB ORDER CONTRACTING IS REALLY A DIFFERENT WAY TO PROCURE A CONTRACT FOR WORK THAT, TODAY, WE ALREADY CONTRACT OUT FOR. SO ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S IMPORTANT IS TO RECOGNIZE THAT IN KIND OF OUR CURRENT STATE THERE ARE MORE THAN 60 CONTRACTS AND THEIR ASSOCIATED PROCUREMENTS THAT WE MAINTAIN TO ACCOMPLISH THE ORDINARY MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR OF OUR FACILITIES. AND THE JOB ORDER CONTRACTING SOLUTION IS, AND WHAT WE'RE SEEKING IS YOUR APPROVAL TO LET US COMPETE AN RFP TO HAVE A SINGLE VENDOR PROVIDE THOSE SERVICES FOR US.

THIS REALLY REPRESENTS A STREAMLINED APPROACH TO DELIVER ALTHOUGH DOLLAR, HIGH VOLUME MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR OPERATIONS THAT ARE RELATED TO OUR FACILITIES. AND AS SUCH, IT ELIMINATES QUITE A BIT OF TRANSACTIONAL WORK FOR PARTS OF THE ORGANIZATION. IN MY OWN ORGANIZATION, CENTRAL PURCHASING, ALL OF THESE PROCUREMENTS AND CONTRACTS WE ESTIMATE ARE ABOUT 80% OF OUR TRANSACTIONAL WORKLOAD. IT'S A GOOD WAY TO DO MORE WITH LESS OR THE SAME WITH OUR RESOURCES. THIS WORK IS TOUCHED BY DEPARTMENTAL CONTRACTING AND PROCUREMENT STAFF AND DCA HUB, AS WELL AS LEGAL WHO IS REVIEWING ALL OF THESE CONTRACTS, AND FACILITIES AND PROPERTY MANAGEMENT STAFF. HENRY CAN SPEAK A LITTLE MORE TO THIS.

SO WHAT'S IN THIS? THIS IS AN APPROACH TO GET OUR MINOR ALTERATION, ORDINARY REPAIR AND MAINTENANCE NECESSARY TO PRESERVE A PUBLIC IMPROVEMENT. THIS IS DIFFERENT FROM PUBLIC WORKS WHICH WE WILL CONTINUE TO BID OUT JUST AS WE DO TODAY UNDER OR PCRB RULES. THESE ARE FOR THE SMALL PROJECTS. AND IN FACT, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE AS A FEATURE OF THIS IS WE WILL NOT ALLOW JOB ORDERS OVER OUR FORMAL PROCUREMENT THRESHOLD, WHICH CURRENTLY IS \$150,000. IF WE HAVE A PROJECT THAT'S OVER THAT THRESHOLD IT'LL BE BID OUT UNDER OUR EXISTING RULES, AND JOB ORDER CONTRACTING WON'T BE APPROPRIATE FOR IT.

TO CLARIFY, FOR PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS, DEFINED AS PROJECTS OR CONSTRUCTION, RECONSTRUCTION, MAJOR RENOVATION ON A REAL PROPERTY BUYER FOR THE COUNTY, THOSE ARE GOING TO BE OFF THE TABLE. THE COUNTY ALWAYS MAINTAINS THE RIGHT OF FIRST REFUSAL TO DO ANY OF THIS WORK WITH IN-HOUSE TRADES, AN IMPORTANT FEATURE OF THIS SYSTEM. ALL OF THE PROJECTS WILL BE PAID AT PREVAILING WAGE. AS WE RUN THE INITIAL PILOT WITH FACILITIES, WE WILL RETURN TO THE BOARD

WITHIN THE FIRST TWO YEARS TO REPORT BACK TO YOU ON THE PROGRESS, AND ALSO TO RECOMMEND WHETHER WE CAN EXPAND THIS TO TRANSPORTATION AND WEATHERIZATION WHERE IT ALSO HAS SOME APPLICABILITY TO THE ORGANIZATION. BUT WE REALLY WANT TO GET FACILITIES FIRST TO MAKE SURE IT'S ACTUALLY WORKING FOR US. BULK TRANSPORTATION AND WEATHERIZATION ARE EXCITED ABOUT THE PROMISE THIS APPROACH HOLDS FOR THEM. IT'S AN ADDITIONAL WAY TO KIND OF LEVERAGE VALUE FOR THE ORGANIZATION, IF THAT'S APPROPRIATE. WE ALSO INTEND TO CHECK BACK IN WITH THE BOARD IN FIVE YEARS TO REVIEW THE PERFORMANCE OF HOW THIS IS WORKING. AND WE MAY AT THAT TIME REQUEST AN ADDITIONAL FIVE YEARS OF PROCUREMENT AUTHORITY. IT IS A LONGER TERM SOLUTION FOR US. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE WORKED INTO THIS APPROPRIATE CHECKBACKS WITH THE BOARD TO REPORT BACK TO YOU ABOUT HOW IT'S ACTUALLY WORKING FOR THE ORGANIZATION.

Mr. Smith: ONE OF THE OTHER AREAS WHERE WE THINK THAT THIS HAS REALLY VALUE FOR THE ORGANIZATION IS REALLY THE IMPACTS FOR MWESB UTILIZATION. THE UTILIZATION OF CERTIFIED FIRMS IS AN IMPORTANT VALUE FOR THE COUNTY. IT'S WRITTEN INTO THE CODE. WE DO A LOT OF WORK TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR CONSTRUCTION OPPORTUNITIES AND OTHER OPPORTUNITIES ARE AVAILABLE TO STATE CERTIFIED FIRMS. WE THINK THAT BECAUSE THESE SMALLER PROJECTS IN THE CONSTRUCTION AREA ARE ONE OF THE AREAS WHERE WE HAVE A GREAT DEAL OF UTILIZATION OF THESE FIRMS SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE DO AT LEAST AS WELL TODAY IF NOT BETTER. I THINK THAT BRINGING ON A JLC AS A PARTNER GIVES US ANOTHER TOOL TO BRING NEW FIRMS INTO THE PIPELINE INTO OUR LOCAL AREA IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING NEW CERTIFIED FIRMS. WE THINK THIS WILL BE ONE OF THE GREAT FEATURES OF THE PROGRAM. WE EXPECT TO REPORT BACK TO YOU ON THAT. I'D LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO HENRY IF YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS.

Mr. Alaman: AS BRIAN SMITH MENTIONED EARLIER, I'M HENRY ALAMAN YOUR FACILITIES AND PROPERTY DIRECTOR. THIS IS A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT FOR FACILITIES. CURRENTLY RIGHT NOW WHAT HAPPENS IS THE PROJECT MANAGERS, WHEN TASKED WITH DOING A REMODEL WITHIN THE MULTNOMAH COUNTY FACILITIES, THEY HAVE TO GET INDIVIDUAL VENDORS FOR FLOORING, CARPENTRY, ELECTRICAL, MECHANICAL. THIS REALLY IS A VERY TIME CONSUMING PROCESS FOR THEM. HAVING A SINGLE POINT OF CONTACT THAT IS RESPONSIBLE FOR WORKING THROUGH AND MAKING SURE THAT INTERFACES ARE TAKEN CARE OF REALLY IS A HUGE BENEFIT NOT ONLY SAVING US TIME BUT ALSO REDUCES OUR RISK, BECAUSE THE COORDINATION OF THOSE SCOPES OF WORK ARE ALREADY ESTABLISHED.

AS FAR AS RESPONSIVENESS, HAVING A CONTRACT IN PLACE ALLOWS US TO REACH OUT TO OUR JOB ORDER CONTRACTING VENDOR AND DISCUSS THE

SCOPE OF WORK, NEGOTIATE THE PRICE, AND GET THE WORK STARTED FAIRLY QUICKLY. THE OTHER THING THAT'S HUGE IS BECAUSE THERE'S A PRICE BOOK THAT WE'RE IN AGREEMENT WITH, IT MITIGATES PRICE FLUCTUATIONS. RIGHT NOW THE MARKET IS VERY HOT. PRICES ARE COMING IN THAT, YOU KNOW, AT TWICE AS MUCH AS WHAT WE EXPECT. WITH A JOB ORDER CONTRACT IN PLACE THOSE PRICES ARE FIXED SITE MITIGATES THOSE PRICE FLUCTUATIONS WE'RE DEALING WITH RIGHT NOW. I'M VERY EXCITED ABOUT THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE THE PILOT PROGRAM. I'M WILLING TO TAKE THE ROLE AND RUN WITH IT.

Chair Kafoury: QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD?

Vice-Chair Smith: I HAVE A QUESTION IN TERMS OF THE MWESB, WILL YOU PUT THAT IN THE RFP AS SOMETHING WE WOULD REALLY LIKE A COMPANY TO REALLY MAKE A PRIORITY?

Mr. Smith: ABSOLUTELY. THE RFP WILL HAVE AS ONE OF THE FEATURES OF THE CONTRACT, WE'LL HAVE A RETAINAGE PERCENTAGE. THAT PERCENTAGE WILL BE BASED ON WHETHER OR NOT YOU MEET YOUR UTILIZATION GOALS ON AN ANNUAL BASIS. WE'LL HAVE SOME FINANCIAL INCENTIVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE GETTING GOOD PERFORMANCE IN TERMS OF UTILIZATION.

Vice-Chair Smith: IN TERMS OF DOLLARS, HOW MUCH WILL WE ACTUALLY PASS OVER TO THE JOC IN DOLLAR AMOUNT?

Mr. Smith: THE ANNUAL SPEND WE'RE ESTIMATING AT ABOUT \$4 MILLION A YEAR. WHAT WE EXPECT THAT IS THEY WILL HAVE A PERCENTAGE OF DOLLAR VOLUME. I'M NOT QUITE SURE WHAT THAT IS. WE'LL HAVE TO SEE WHAT COMES IN TERMS OF THE PROPOSALS ON THE RFP.

Vice-Chair Smith: THANK YOU.

Commissioner Shiprack: I WANT TO THANK YOU, BRIAN AND HENRY. AS YOU WELL KNOW, I GET UNCOMFORTABLE AND JUST A LITTLE BIT FUSSY AT WHAT I PERCEIVE AS THE DELICACY BETWEEN THE PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTORS. THIS AREA OF INTERFACE, IT'S WHAT YOU BOTH DO ALL THE TIME. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT AND I JUST HAVE SEEN SUCH AN INCREASE IN SOPHISTICATION. I THINK THAT THIS IS EXTRAORDINARY, A GREAT STEP FORWARD. IT HELPS US BE MORE STREAMLINED. I HADN'T HAD THE CHANCE TO LET YOU KNOW AFTER YOU BRIEFED ME ON IT AND I WAS A LITTLE BIT SKEPTICAL. I WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW I THINK IT PASSES ALL OF THE CHECKS AND I APPRECIATE THAT YOU'LL BE COMING BACK AND REPORTING TO US ON HOW THIS WORKS AND WE MAY BE INCREASING OUR RELIANCE ON IT. SO CARRY ON, LOOKS GOOD.

Chair Kafoury: THANKS. I ALSO WANT TO ADD MY APPRECIATION FOR YOUR CREATIVE THINKING. I ALWAYS CAN COUNT ON YOU GUYS TO BE PUSHING AND LEADING US IN A DIRECTION THAT SOUNDS LIKE IT'S GOING SAVE US A TON OF TIME, WHICH I THINK IS GOING TO BE REALLY BENEFICIAL FOR OUR STAFF AND FOR THE END PRODUCT AND FOR OUR COMMUNITY. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS. LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING BACK ON HOW IT ACTUALLY IS WORKING. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR VOTE AYE. [UNANIMOUS AYES] THE ALTERNATIVE CONTRACTOR METHOD IS APPROVED. THANK YOU.

R.4 Acting as the PCRB - Approval of a Class Special Procurement to Extend Existing Contractual Relationships to Permit the Introduction of a Job Order Contracting Process. Presenters: Brian R. Smith, Purchasing Manager.

Chair Kafoury: COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK MOVES AND COMMISSIONER SMITH SECONDS APPROVAL OF R.4. GOOD MORNING AGAIN!

Mr. Smith: GOOD MORNING! THIS IS A SECOND ITEM. WHAT WE'RE ASKING FOR HERE IS TO APPROVE A CLASS SPECIAL PROCUREMENT TO EXTEND 34 MAINTENANCE REPAIR AND OPERATIONS CONTRACT FOR TWO YEARS TO ACCOMMODATE FOR A SMOOTH TRANSITION TO A JOB ORDER CONTRACTING SYSTEM. THESE 34 CONTRACTS THAT WERE LISTED IN THE MATERIALS, THESE ARE 34 OF OUR EXISTING APPROXIMATELY 60 OR SO THAT WE WOULD EXPECT TO MOVE OVER TO THE JOC PROVIDER. AND I KIND OF DESCRIBE IT AS TRYING TO CHANGE THE WHEELS ON A CAR WHILE YOU'RE SPEEDING DOWN THE ROAD. WHAT WE'RE ASKING IS THESE ARE EXISTING CONTRACTS, MOST OF THEM PUT INTO PLACE THROUGH COMPETITIVE PROCESSES. WE'RE ASKING FOR AN ADDITIONAL TWO YEARS TO SIMPLY EXTEND THE TIME. WHAT THIS WILL ALLOW TO US DO IS SAY OFF THE TRANSACTIONAL PRESSURE, AT THE SAME TIME TRYING TO TRANSITION THEM TO SERVICES UNDER THE JOC. WITH THAT, I WILL OPEN IT UP TO QUESTIONS.

Chair Kafoury: QUESTIONS, COMMENTS?

Vice-Chair Smith: SOUNDS GREAT TO ME, IS THERE A FISCAL IMPACT ON DOING IT THIS WAY?

Mr. Smith: FOR THESE PARTICULAR CONTRACTS? IT EXTENDS THEM, THEIR PROCUREMENT AUTHORITY. THE SPEND SHOULD BE THE SAME IN TERMS OF UNDER THE FACILITIES BUDGET.

Commissioner Shiprack: THANK YOU, MADAME CHAIR. I GUESS MY ONE CONCERN IS A KIND OF CONTRACT CREEP, WHERE A CONTRACT BEGINS AT SOME LEVEL, AND THEN INCREASES WITHOUT ANY DEGREE OF OVERSIGHT UNDER THE MANTLE OF THE \$150,000 LIMIT. I TRUST THAT YOU WILL BE

WATCHING FOR THAT CLOSELY AND REPORTING BACK TO US ON THAT PHENOMENON.

Mr. Smith: ABSOLUTELY COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK.

Chair Kafoury: ALL THOSE IN FAVOR VOTE AYE. [UNANIMOUS AYES] THE CLASS SPECIAL PROCUREMENT IS APPROVED. THANK YOU.

R.2 Proclamation Declaring March as Purchasing Month in Multnomah County, Oregon. Presenters: Brian R. Smith, Purchasing Manager and Mark Campbell, Chief Financial Officer.

Chair Kafoury: I HATE TO POSTPONE A LOVELY PROCLAMATION. I KNOW THAT IT IS NOT BECAUSE WE DO NOT WANT TO NOT PROCLAIM MARCH AS PURCHASING MONTH IN MULTNOMAH COUNTY. BUT SINCE THIS IS THE BEGINNING OF MARCH WE HAVE SO MUCH TIME LEFT TO CELEBRATE, SO WE'LL CELEBRATE NOW AND CELEBRATE ON MARCH 10TH. DUE TO TIME CONSTRAINTS WE ARE GOING TO HAVE TO POSTPONE R.2 TO A TIME CERTAIN IN MARCH.

Ms. Madkour: CHAIR KAFOURY, WE NEED TO ADJOURN AS THE CONTRACT REVIEW BOARD.

Chair Kafoury: FIRST WE WILL CONVENE AS THE CONTRACT REVIEW BOARD AND RECONVENE AS THE MULTNOMAH BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS. THE CONTRACT REVIEW BOARD CAN'T DO A PROCLAMATION? I'M JUST KIDDING. [LAUGHTER] RHETORICAL QUESTION.

Chair Kafoury: COMMISSIONER SHIPRACK MOVES AND COMMISSIONER SMITH SECONDS, MOTION TO POSTPONE R.2 TO A TIME CERTAIN, MARCH 10TH. ALL IN FAVOR VOTE AYE [UNANIMOUS AYES].

Commissioner Shiprack: I REALIZE THIS IS A LITTLE BIT PROCEDURALLY OFF BUT I JUST WANT TO COMMENT BECAUSE THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE IN THE ROOM ON THIS PROCLAMATION RIGHT NOW. WE HAVE THE UNITED STATES ATTORNEY GENERAL IN TOWN AND WE ARE HURRYING OVER TO VISIT WITH HER. SO JUST SO YOU KNOW IT'S AN EXTRAORDINARY REASON THAT WE WOULD ASK YOU TO POSTPONE BUT WE HAVE A CHANCE TO SEE YOU IN THE ROOM TODAY AND YOU GET VETTED TWICE.

Chair Kafoury: LET'S DO A ROUND OF APPLAUSE NOW AND NEXT WEEK. [APPLAUSE]

BOARD COMMENT

No Board comments were made.

ADJOURNMENT – 10:32 a.m.

Chair Kafoury: SEEING NO FURTHER BUSINESS WE'RE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.

ADJOURNMENT

[CAPTIONS PROVIDED BY LNS CAPTIONING AND MAY INCLUDE INACCURATE WORDS OR PHRASES DUE TO SOUND QUALITY, OTHER TECHNICAL DIFFICULTIES AND/OR SOFTWARE ERRORS.]

For access to the video and/or board packet materials, please view at:
http://multnomah.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=3

Submitted by:
Lynda J. Grow, Board Clerk and
Marina Baker, Assistant Board Clerk
Board of County Commissioners
Multnomah County, Oregon